Recommended Amendments following consideration of submitter evidence & hearing appearances – Michael Bathgate [Updated for Kā Rūnaka Reply]

KEY:

Ms Picard's amendments:

<u>Green underline</u> and <u>strike through</u> text are recommended amendments to notified provisions made in response to submitter evidence, Highlights Summary 29/06/20.

Red underline and strike through text are recommended amendments made in section 42A report, 18/03/2

Any black <u>underlined</u> or strike through text, reflect notified variations.

Mr Bathgate's amendments:

Blue underline and strike through are recommended amendments to notified provisions made in response to submitter evidence and hearing appearances (incorporating earlier changes in pre-circulated evidence, and sometimes adopting Ms Picard's recommended amendments)

Italics indicates non-drafting changes recommended or when providing clarification with respect to recommended amendments.

Yellow highlighting indicates further amendments recommended in reply to questions raised by Commissioners during Kā Rūnaka's presentation.

Provision/S42a	Sarah Picard Recommended Amendments following	Michael Bathgate Recommended Amendments following
Торіс	consideration of submitter evidence	consideration of submitter evidence & hearing appearances
Objective 39.2.1	The values held by Manawhenua, in particular within identified	The values held by Manawhenua, in particular within identified
	wāhi tūpuna areas, are recognised and provided for, and	wāhi tūpuna areas, are recognised and provided for, and
	considered as part of decision making.	considered as part of decision making.
Policy 39.2.1.1	Recognise that the following activities may be incompatible with	Recommend move Policy 39.2.1.1 to Chapter 5 Tangata Whenua,
	values held by Manawhenua where ever they occur within the	to new Policy 5.3.1.5, with following amendment:
	District;	
	 a. Mining and mining activities, including gravel extraction; b. Landfills; 	Recognise that the following activities may be <u>have effects that are</u> incompatible with values held by Manawhenua where ever they occur within the District;
	c. Cemeteries and crematoria;	

Provision/S42a	Sarah Picard Recommended Amendments following	Michael Bathgate Recommended Amendments following
Торіс	consideration of submitter evidence	consideration of submitter evidence & hearing appearances
	 d. Forestry; e. Removal of indigenous vegetation from significant natural areas (SNA); and f. Wastewater treatment plants. 	Alternately, if remaining in Chapter 39, amend as follows: Recognise that the following activities may be have effects that are particularly incompatible with values held by Manawhenua where ever they occur within the District when they occur within an identified wāhi tūpuna area;
Policy 39.2.1.2	 Recognise that the following activities may be incompatible with values held by Manawhenau when the activity includes activities or effects that are a recognised threat and could result in the modification, damage or destruction of values held for an identified wāhi tūpuna area, as set out in Schedule 39.6: a. Activities affecting water quality, including buildings or structures in close proximity to waterbodies; b. Earthworks which exceed 10m³ outside of the urban environment; c. Buildings and structures; d. Forestry, except for Plantation Forestry where the Resource Management (National Environmental Standard for Plantation Forestry) Regulations 2017 prevails; e. New roads, additions/alterations to existing roads, vehicle tracks and driveways; f. Activities that affect a ridgeline including buildings and structures, and activities on the upper slopes; g. Commercial and commercial recreational activities; h. Activities within Significant Natural Areas; i. Subdivision and development outside of the urban environment; or j. Utilities and energy activities. 	 Recognise that the following activities may be have effects that are incompatible with <u>cultural</u> values held by <u>Manawhenau</u> <u>Manawhenau</u> when the activity includes activities or effects that are listed as a recognised potential threat and could result in the modification, damage or destruction of values held for an identified wāhi tūpuna area, as set out in Schedule 39.6: a. Activities affecting water quality, including buildings or structures in close proximity to waterbodies; b. Earthworks which exceed 10m³ outside of the urban environment; c. Buildings and structures; d. Forestry, except for Plantation Forestry where the Resource Management (National Environmental Standard for Plantation Forestry) Regulations 2017 prevails; e. New roads, additions/alterations to existing roads, vehicle tracks and driveways; f. Activities that affect a ridgeline including buildings and structures, and activities on the upper slopes; g. Commercial and commercial recreational activities; h. Activities within Significant Natural Areas;

Provision/S42a	Sarah Picard Recommended Amendments following	Michael Bathgate Recommended Amendments following
Торіс	consideration of submitter evidence	consideration of submitter evidence & hearing appearances
		i. Subdivision and development outside of the urban
		environment; or
		j. Utilities and energy activities.
Policy 39.2.1.3	Recognise that certain activities, when undertaken in wāhi tūpuna	Recognise that certain activities, when undertaken in In identified
	areas, can have such significant adverse effects on Manawhenua	wāhi tūpuna areas , can have<u>:</u>
	values <u>that they are culturally inappropriate and should must</u> be	a. such significant adverse effects on the cultural values of
	avoided.	manawhenua values that they are culturally inappropriate and
		should must be avoided; and
		b. other adverse effects on the cultural values of manawhenua
		must be avoided, remedied or mitigated.
Policy 39.2.1.4	Avoid significant adverse effects on values within wāhi tūpuna	Avoid significant adverse effects on values within wahi tupuna
	areas and where significant adverse effects cannot be practicably	areas and where significant adverse effects cannot be practicably
	avoided, require them to be remedied or mitigated. Avoid, remedy	avoided, require them to be remedied or mitigated.
	or mitigate any other adverse effects on the cultural values of	
	Manawhenua of on the identified wahi tupuna areas.	
Policy 39.2.1.5	Encourage consultation with Manawhenua as the most appropriate	Encourage consultation with Manawhenua as the most
	way for obtaining understanding of the impact of any activity on a	appropriate way for obtaining understanding of the impact of any
	wāhi tūpuna area.	activity on a wāhi tūpuna area.
Policy 39.2.1.6	Recognise that an application for activities as set out in Policy	Recognise that an application that does not include detail of
	39.2.1.1 and Policy 39.2.1.2 that does not include detail of	consultation undertaken with mana whenua may require a
	consultation undertaken with Manawhenua mana whenua may	cultural impact assessment as part of an Assessment of
	require a cultural impact assessment as part of an Assessment of	Environment Effects so that any adverse effects that an activity
	Environment Effects so that any adverse effects that-an the activity	may have on a wāhi tūpuna can be understood.
	may have on the cultural values of Manawhenua of on the	Delete policy, consider inserting method
	identified wāhi tūpuna areas a wāhi tūpuna can be understood.	
Policy 39.2.1.7	When deciding whether mana whenua Manawhenua are an	When deciding whether mana whenua Manawhenua_are an
	affected person in relation to any activity for the purposes of	affected person in relation to any activity for the purposes of

Provision/S42a	Sarah Picard Recommended Amendments following	Michael Bathgate Recommended Amendments following
Торіс	consideration of submitter evidence	consideration of submitter evidence & hearing appearances
	section 95E of the Resource Management Act 1991 the Council will	section 95E of the Resource Management Act 1991 the Council
	consider Policies 39.2.1.1 and 39.2.1.2.	will consider Policies 39.2.1.1 and 39.2.1.2.
		Delete policy, consider inserting method
Schedule 39.6	[Mapping of urban wāhi tūpuna not supported by Ms Picard]	Number and map the following urban wāhi tūpuna: Tāhuna
		(Queenstown), Te Kirikiri, Take Kārara
		Amend column titles as follows: Recognised Potential Threats
		Replace the current wording in the Potential Threats column for
		these 3 urban wāhi tūpuna with the following:
	Due to its extensive level of modification, there are no recognised	Due to its extensive level of modification, there are no recognised
	threats listed for this wahi tupuna and the rules specific to wahi	potential threats listed for this wahi tupuna and the rules specific
	tūpuna do not apply. However, this wāhi tūpuna remains	to wāhi tūpuna do not apply. However, this wāhi tūpuna remains
	significant to Manawhenua.	significant to manawhenua and cultural values may be considered
		relevant to assessment of discretionary and non-complying
		activities.
		Remove notation regarding urbanised area of Hāwea from description column for # 2 Paetarariki & Timaru
	[Supported by Ms Picard]	
		Amend wāhi tūpuna descriptions and values in Schedule 39.6, as
		per the revised descriptions and values set out in Appendix 1 of the
		cultural evidence of Edward Ellison.

Provision/S42a	0			Michael I	Bathgate Recommended Amendments follow	ing		
Торіс	consideration of submitter evidence			consideration of submitter evidence & hearing appearances				
Mapping	activities in the urban environment]		Include differentiated mapping for all areas where wāhi tūpuna overlap with Urban Environment zones to indicate "Urban Wāhi Tūpuna", including Tāhuna (Queenstown), Te Kirikiri, Take Kārara. Notate these urban areas to indicate that the rules specific to wāhi tūpuna do not apply, but the important values of these wāhi tūpuna for manawhenua may be used in assessing notified discretionary or non-complying activities. [NB: the intention of the proposed notation was not to suggest that all D, NC consents in these areas should be notified].					
Earthworks	25.3.4 Advice Notes – General25.3.4.5For Rule 25.5.22 the urban environment relates tothose zones set out in Part 3: Urban Environment and the OpenSpace and Recreation Zones within the Urban Growth Boundary				25.3.4 Advice Notes – General25.3.4.5For Rules 25.5.7 and 25.5.11-25.5.22 the urbanenvironment relates to those zones set out in Part 3: UrbanEnvironment and the Open Space and Recreation Zones withinthe Urban Growth Boundary			
	Rule	Table 25.1	Activity Status	Rule	Table 25.1	Activity Status		
	25.4.5	Earthworks 25.4.5.1 that modify, damage or destroy a wāhi tapu, wāhi tūpuna or other site of significance to Māori <u>as identified in</u> <u>Schedule 39.6</u> whether identified on the Planning Maps or not; Discretion is restricted to: Effects on cultural values of Manawhenua. [Rule 25.4.5.2 & Rule 25.4.5.3 not part of this review]	RD	25.4.5	Earthworks 25.4.5.1 that modify, damage or destroy a wāhi tapu, wāhi tūpuna or other site of significance to Māori <u>as identified in</u> <u>Schedule 39.6</u> whether identified on the <u>Planning Maps or not;</u> <u>Discretion is restricted to:</u> <u>Effects on cultural values of Manawhenua.</u> [Rule 25.4.5.2 & Rule 25.4.5.3 not part of this review]	RÐ		

Provision/S42a	Sarah Picard Recommended Amendments following			Michael Bathgate Recommended Amendments following				
Торіс	consideration of submitter evidence				consideration of submitter evidence & hearing appearances			
	Rule	Table 25.2 – Maximum Volume	Maximu m Total Volume	Rule	Table 25.2 – Maximum Volume	Maximum Total Volume		
	25.5.2	[delete this text only, remainder of Rule remains and does not form part of this proposal] <u>Wāhi Tūpuna areas</u>	10m³	25.5.2	[delete this text only, remainder of Rule remains and does not form part of this proposal] <u>Wāhi Tūpuna areas</u>	10m³		
	25.5.7	25.5.7.2 Roads located within an Outstanding Natural Feature identified on the Planning Maps <u>and wāhi tūpuna areas</u> <u>where roads have been identified as a</u> <u>recognised threat to the values of the area</u> (see Schedule 39.6)	10m ³	25.5.7	25.5.7.2 Roads located within: <u>a)</u> an Outstanding Natural Feature identified on the Planning Maps <u>and</u> <u>b)</u> wāhi tūpuna areas <u>outside the urban</u> <u>environment where roads have been</u> <u>identified as a recognised threat to the</u> <u>values of the area (see Schedule 39.6)</u> <u>Except that 25.5.7.2.b does not apply to</u> <u>earthworks for the operation, repair and</u> <u>maintenance of the existing formed</u>	10m ³		
	<u>25.5.11</u>	Wāhi Tūpuna areas Te Rua Tūpāpaku (Number 5), Mou Tapu (Number 9), Te Koroka (Number 12), Punatapu (Number 16), Te Tapunui (Number 20), Kā Kamu a Hakitekura (Number 22), and Te Taumata o Hakitekura (Number 27).	<u>10m³</u>	25.5.11	roading network.25.5.11.1 In the following Wāhi Tūpunaareas:Te Rua Tūpāpaku (Number 5), Mou Tapu (Number 9), Te Koroka (Number 12), Punatapu (Number 16), Te Tapunui (Number 20), Kā Kamu a Hakitekura (Number 20), Kā Kamu a Hakitekura (Number 22), and Te Taumata o Hakitekura (Number 27).25.5.11.2 In Wāhi Tūpuna areas not listed in 25.5.11.1: a. Earthworks within 20m of the bed of any wetland, river or lake;	<u>10m³</u>		

Provision/S42a	Sarah Picard Recommended Amendments following			Michael Bathgate Recommended Amendments following		
Торіс	consideration of submitter evidence cor			consideration of submitter evidence & hearing appearances		
	Rule 25.5.22	Table 25.3 – Standards Any earthworks undertaken in a wāhi tūpuna, with the exception of the wāhi tūpuna listed in Rule 25.5.11 (Table 25.2) or located in the urban environment shall: 25.5.22.1 Be setback a minimum of 20m from a waterbody; 25.5.22.2 not exceed an elevation of 400masl; or 25.5.22.3 not modify a skyline or terrace edge viewed either from adjoining sites, or formed roads within 2km of the earthworks.	Maximum Total Volume <u>RD</u>	 b. Earthworks located at an elevation exceeding 400 masl, except within Örau (Number 12). c. For Örau (Number 12), earthworks located at an elevation exceeding 600 masl. d. Earthworks that modify a skyline or terrace edge when viewed from an adjacent public place. Except that: e. The following are exempt from Rule 25.5.11.1 and Rule 25.5.11.2: i. Earthworks located in the urban environment. ii. Earthworks for the minor upgrading of underground electricity cables or overhead lines, except where this involves the addition of new support structures. iii. Earthworks required for the planting of indigenous species. f. The following are exempt from Rule 25.5.11.2.b and 25.5.11.2.c: iv. Earthworks as part of farming activity for the digging of silage pits or the clearance of drains. 		

Provision/S42a	Sarah Picard Recommended Amendments following	Michael Bathgate Recommended Amendments following			
Торіс	consideration of submitter evidence	consideration of submitter evidence & hearing appearances			
		g. More than one instance of earthworks up to 10m ³ may be undertaken on the same site within any consecutive 12 month period, provided that each earthworks activity is located at least 400m from any other earthworks activity subject to this maximum volume rule. [Do not support Ms Picard's recommended 25.5.22 as it makes no allowance for up to 10m ³ of earthworks in these areas, and does not appear to exempt urban areas from Rule 25.5.11. It also			
		seems to preclude volume-specific exemptions in Chapter 25 e.g. 25.3.2.5 and 25.3.2.7. Note the latter exemption appears to exempt earthworks within a consented building platform, which would include earthworks for such purpose in a wāhi tūpuna – as requested by some submitters.]			
2 <u>t</u> f 2 <u>c</u>	 25.7 Matters of Discretion 25.7.1 For all restricted discretionary activities, except in relation to Rule 25.5.11 and 25.5.22, discretion shall be restricted to the following. 25.7.2 For any restricted discretionary resource consent for non- compliance with Rule 25.5.11 and 25.5.22 discretion shall be restricted to effects on cultural values of Manawhenua. 	25.7.1 For all restricted discretionary activities, <u>except in relat</u> to Rule 25.5.7.2.b and 25.5.11 and 25.5.22, discretion shall be			

Farm Buildings		Table 39.4 - Activity		Activity Status			Table 39.4 - Activity		Activity Status
	39.4.1	A new farm building within 30m existing farm building within an wāhi tūpuna area.		<u>P</u>		39.4.1	A new farm building within 30m o existing farm building within an id wāhi tūpuna area.		<u>P</u>
		Table 39.X –farm buildings within an identified wāhi tūpuna area	<u>Non-com</u> <u>stat</u>				Table 39.X –farm buildings within an identified wāhi tūpuna area		<u>mpliance</u> atus
	39.5.1	Any farm building, other than provided for by Rule 39.4.1, shall be located at an elevation no greater than 400 masl.	<u>of</u>	- is :0:	<u>alues</u>		Any new farm building, other than provided for by Rule 39.4.1, shall be located at an elevation no greater than 400 masl, except within Ōrau (Number 12) where farm buildings may be located at an elevation up to 600masl.	Discretio restricted a. Effec cultu of	d to:
	39.X.2	Any farm building, other than provided for by Rule 39.4.1, shall not modify a skyline or terrace edge when viewed from either; adjoining sites, or formed roads within 2km of the location of the proposed building.	<u>of</u>	- is :0:		39.X.2	Any farm building, other than provided for by Rule 39.4.1, shall not modify a skyline or terrace edge when viewed from either; adjoining sites, or formed roads within 2km of the location of the proposed building a public place within 2km of the location of the proposed building.	Discretio restricted a. <u>Effec</u> <u>cultu</u> of	d to:
Subdivision		1					1		

Provision/S42a	Sarah Picard Recommended Amendments following			Michael Bathgate Recommended Amendments following			
Торіс	consideration of submitter evidence			consideratio	on of submitter evidence & hearing appear	ances	
	Rule	Subdivision Activities – District Wide	Activity Status		Rule	Subdivision Activities – District Wide	Activity Status
	27.5. 12A XX	The subdivision of land within a wāhitūpuna area where subdivision is arecognised threat as set out inSchedule 39.6.Discretion is restricted to:a.Effects on cultural valuesof Manawhenua.	<u>RD D</u>		<u>27.5.12A</u> <u>XX</u>	The subdivision of land within a wāhitūpuna outside the urban environment,where subdivision is a recognised threatas set out in Schedule 39.6.Discretion is restricted to:a.Effects on cultural values of Manawhenua	<u>RD</u> D
					consider the	an environment" not defined in Chapter 27 b notation important for plan clarity – may re as per recommended Earthworks 25.3.4.5]	
Glossary and Definitions	Glossary mo	ved from Section 5.5 to Section 2.3		Support Ms Picard's amendments			

Vater	Table 39.5 - Setback from water bodies within a wāhi tūpuna area	Non-compliance status		Table 39.5 - Setback from water bodies within a wāhi tūpuna area	Non-compliance status
39.5.1	Any buildings or structures: 	RD	39.5.1	Any buildings or structures:	RD
39.5.2	structures: a. within a wāhi tūpuna area (identified in Schedule 39.6); b. where activities affecting water quality are a recognised threat; and c. are within the following zones: i. Rural; ii. Rural Residential and Rural Lifestyle; or iii. Gibbston Character. Shall be setback a minimum of 20m from a waterbody wetland, river or lake.	RD Discretion is restricted to: a. Effects on cultural values of Manawhenua.	39.5.2	Any buildings or structures that are: a. within a wāhi tūpuna area (identified in Schedule 39.6); b. where activities affecting water quality are a recognised threat; and c. are within the following zones: i. Rural; ii. Rural Residential and Rural Lifestyle; or iii. Gibbston Character. Shall be setback a minimum of 20m from a waterbody wetland, river or lake.	RD Discretion is restricted to: a. Effects on cultural values of Manawhenua.

	 a. within a wāhi tūpuna area (identified in Schedule 39.6); b. where activities affecting water quality are a recognised threat; and c. are within the following zones: i. Wakatipu Lifestyle Precinct; or ii. Open Space and Recreation Shall be setback a minimum of 30m from a waterbody wetland, river or lake. 	Discretion is restricted to: a. Effects on cultural values of Manawhenua.	39.5.2 ar a. <u>Post</u> b. <u>Struc</u> <u>maxi</u> c. <u>Minc</u> <u>telec</u>	Any buildings or structures that are: a. within a wāhi tūpuna area (identified in Schedule 39.6); b. where activities affecting water quality are a recognised threat; and c. are within the following zones: i. Wakatipu Lifestyle Precinct Rural Amenity Zone; or ii. Open Space and Recreation Shall be setback a minimum of 30m from a waterbody wetland, river or lake. hat the following structures shift and wire fences. tures with a maximum height mum footprint no greater that or upgrading of electricity trans- ommunication lines, except with tion of new support structures	no greater than 2m and a n 5m ² . smission and distribution or here this involves the
--	--	---	---	---	---

Provision/S42a	Sarah Picard Recommended Amendments following	Michael Bathgate Recommended Amendments following
Торіс	consideration of submitter evidence	consideration of submitter evidence & hearing appearances
Other	Various recommended amendments under 39.3 Other Provisions	Support Ms Picard's amendments but note that the "District
Amendments	and Rules	Wide" component of 39.3 may require numbering for consistency
		with other chapters