

Plan Change 48 - Signs Section 32 Analysis

February 2014

Executive Summary

Signage has been controlled by two mechanisms; the District Plan and the Signs Bylaw. This has created confusion in administration and uncertainty for the pubic regarding the controls and restrictions that apply. This plan change is premised on the District Plan, specifically the Signage Chapter being the sole planning document controlling signage. A signs Bylaw will no longer apply.

This Plan Change therefore proposes changes to the existing Signage Chapter (Chapter 18) to ensure all signage is covered by the District Plan.

In addition, monitoring and consultation has highlighted opportunities to streamline and clarify consenting requirements around signage control. Accordingly the following key changes are proposed:

- Amendments to the definition of sign.
- Providing for signage platforms, and identification of signs within these as a permitted activity.
- Changes to the activity status from non-complying to permitted, controlled and discretionary for most breaches of signage limits.
- Changing the layout of the chapter to a table based format with like zones grouped together and district wide signage controls provided.
- Greater clarity over the control of signs in the windows of buildings and allocation of signage in multi-tenant situations.
- Increasing the allowance for signage within commercial zones to better align signage allowances with the scale of buildings.
- Greater clarity over potential effects of signage through provision of assessment matters.

The review of signage controls was commenced as part of the work relating to the District Plan review. However, it has been considered that a Plan Change progressed now, can realise a number of opportunities to streamline controls and the independent nature of this chapter means that it can fit relatively easily into any future structure of the District Plan or the wider review.

Section 75(1) Contents of District Plans also identifies the elements a plan must state. These are Objectives, Policies and Rules. As part of this Plan Change it is proposed to simplify the content of Chapter 18 and reduce its overall length by no longer identifying the Issues, Implementation Methods and Environmental Results Anticipated within the content of the chapter.

Contents

1.	INTRODUCTION	4
2.	POLICY CONTEXT	4
2.1	Statutory Policy Context	4
2.2	Non-statutory Policy Context	
3.	CONSULTATION	5
4.	RESOURCE MANAGEMENT ISSUES	6
5.	PROBLEMS IDENTIFIED WITH THE OPERATION OF SECTION 18 -	
	SIGNS IN THE OPERATIVE DISTRICT PLAN	
6.	EVALUATION	11
6.1	Appropriateness of Objectives to achieve purpose of RMA s32(1)(a)	11
6.2	Identification of Other Reasonably Practical Options s32(1)(b)(i)	15
6.3	Assessment of Provisions (Policies, Rules and other methods)	
	s32(1)(b)(ii)	18
6.4	Rules and Methods	22
7.	DESCRIPTIVE TEXT FORMERLY IN THE DISTRICT PLAN	30
7.1	ISSUES	30
7.2	Monitoring	30
7.3	Environmental Results Anticipated	30
7.4	Explanation and Principal Reasons for Adoption	
7.5	Implementation Methods	

INTRODUCTION

This report is an evaluation of the proposed objectives, policies and methods relating to the management of signage within Chapter 18 - Signs of the District Plan under Section 32 of the RMA. At the time of the final preparation of these reports the Resource Management Amendment Act 2013 (RMAA2013) had taken effect (4 December 2013), and this assessment has been undertaken in accordance with these amendments.

POLICY CONTEXT

Statutory Policy Context

There are no matters of specific relevance with regards to signage detailed within any National Policy Statement or the Otago Regional Policy Statement.

Relevant RMA Sections

Section 5 outlines the purpose of the Act as being the promotion of sustainable management of natural and physical resources. Sustainable management means:

"managing the use, development and protection of natural and physical resources in a way, or at a rate, which enables people and communities to provide for their social, economic, and cultural well-being and for their health and safety while —"

The use of signage is an important aspect of commercial operations in advertising their businesses and subsequently providing for economic well-being.

Section 6 outlines matters of national importance. It is not considered that the matter of signage is a matter of national importance.

Section 7 outlines other matters that should be considered when exercising functions and powers in achieving the purpose of the Act.

The following matter is considered relevant:

"7(c) The maintenance and enhancement of amenity values"

Controlling the extent of signage to be established through rules in the District Plan will assist in maintaining the amenity values of the various Zones within the Queenstown Lakes District.

Non-statutory Policy Context

The Queenstown Lakes District Council does have a non-statutory document entitled "Queenstown Town Centre Character Guidelines" that provides insight into the context and attributes of the built fabric of the Town Centre, and guidance to ensure that new development will positively contribute to this area.

The architectural design guidelines contain some philosophies that are relevant and transferrable to signage design.

BACKGROUND REPORTS AND SUPPORTING INFORMATION:

QLDC Signs Monitoring Report Appendix 1

This report has assisted in the identification of relevant issues in terms of the efficiency and effectiveness with the operative plan provisions.

Signs Workshop 24 February 2011 - Questions for Discussion Appendix 2

The questions and list of known issues have been used in conjunction with the identification of known problems to identify the issues with the current provisions of Section 18.

Signs Consultation Brochure Appendix 3

The proposed changes and the responses to the consultation were used as a starting point for amendment of the existing sign provisions.

CONSULTATION

In accordance with the requirements of the RMA, consultation has been undertaken with the local community, practitioners, landowners and other key stakeholders. The consultation undertaken is summarised as follows:

- Consultation was undertaken with (formerly) Lakes Environmental planning staff in January 2012 to identify the issues they experienced with regard to the processing of applications under the operative District Plan provisions relating to signs.
- A workshop was held with local resource management consultants, Lakes Environmental's planning and enforcement staff on 24 February 2012. At this workshop, a list of 'known problems' with the operative sign provisions was circulated, and solutions to fix the problems were identified.
- The Council prepared a monitoring report on the signs provisions. This
 report was finalised in July 2012 and was formally received by the
 Council at the Strategy Committee meeting of 28 August 2012.
- A workshop on the signs provisions was also undertaken with the Councillors on 23 August 2012 where it was discussed that the District Plan was the preferred singular high level mechanism for the management of signs.
- In October 2012 a consultation brochure on signs provisions was sent out to sign writers, planning consultants, architects and business groups. The brochure (<u>Appendix 1</u>) was also publicly available in Council offices and on the council website. Two responses were received.

 On Friday 15th March 2013 the consultant planner preparing the Section 32 Report on the signs chapter of the District Plan and Council's Senior Policy Analyst Blair Devlin met with Diversified New Zealand Property Fund, developers of the Remarkables Park shopping centre, to discuss their submission.

Following the above, drafting of the Section 32 report and associated provisions commenced.

RESOURCE MANAGEMENT ISSUES FOR SECTION 18 - SIGNS

The following resource management issues are identified in the Operative District Plan under Section 18 - Signs.

"18.1.2 Issues

In order to protect people's safety and well-being some control of signs is required. The Council is also required to avoid, remedy, or mitigate any potential adverse effects on the environment which may arise from the use of signs.

i Safety

The most significant potential adverse effects of signage are on traffic safety, and on visual amenity. In respect of a traffic safety viewpoint, careful consideration needs to be given to advertising along State Highways and major arterial routes, where the potential for conflicts with traffic safety are highest. The potential adverse effects of signs on traffic safety include:

- distraction of drivers' attention due to inappropriateness of the location, design, size or type of sign.
- poor location or design of sign causing impulsive driver action, such as stopping or sudden turning movements without giving an adequate warning signal.

All signage situated within a State Highway is subject to the controls specified in the Transit New Zealand Bylaw 1987/3. State Highways and roads are designated for their transportation purpose, therefore all activities, including signs, for State Highway or road purposes are permitted as an integral part of the road designation. Any other activities, which are proposed to be undertaken within the State Highway or road, including signs, require the approval of the designating authority, either Transit New Zealand in the case of State Highways or the Council for other roads. Signs located within or along State Highways and other designated roads, other than for roading purposes, have the same potential adverse effects on traffic safety as on-site signs, and therefore may need to be controlled. The Council also

controls signboards on roads within the towns by way of a Bylaw and considers it appropriate to continue to do so.

ii Visual Amenity

The need for controls on signs in the District is also important to ensure the potential visual effects of signs do not adversely affect the amenities of the District. Because of their different characteristics, residential and rural areas are more susceptible than commercial and industrial areas to the potential impacts of signs. Therefore different forms of control are required to maintain and enhance the visual amenities of different areas and to have regard to the cumulative effect of signs over time. The high visual quality of the landscape, townscape, the compatibility of buildings and structures in that landscape is an important factor in the social and economic well-being of the District's inhabitants and businesses. As such the appropriateness of any signs needs to be assessed in terms of the visual environment and the effect they may have on the image of the District.

iii Water Area Values

Because of the intensity of use and popularity of the District's lakes and rivers there is potential for conflict between the various activities and facilities, including signs which are established on or along the perimeter of the major lakes and rivers.

The issues identified within the Operative District Plan are still considered relevant today. Minor changes are necessary to update the references to State Highway administration and its associated sign controls to the now New Zealand Transport Agency regulations.

Other than this minor alteration, the key issues continue to be the effects of signage on visual amenity and traffic safety.

PROBLEMS IDENTIFIED WITH THE OPERATION OF SECTION 18 – SIGNS IN THE OPERATIVE DISTRICT PLAN

The following seven issues have been identified in relation to the operative provisions of Section 18 - Signs. Issues were identified from monitoring, public consultation and feedback from local authority consents and enforcement staff.

1. The Use of the QLDC Signs Bylaw 2006 and the District Plan to Control Signs

Both submitters on the signs consultation brochure and those persons who attended the signs workshop in February 2012 identified that the dual control of the QLDC Signs Bylaw 2006 ("Signs Bylaw") and the District Plan to control signs is confusing and that the two documents include a number of inconsistencies.

The general public has no singular document in which to assess their proposed signs for compliance with the applicable rules. Often members of the public will review the District Plan see that their signs comply with the provisions contained within Section 18 and proceed to establish them without obtaining a Signs Permit as there is no reference to the Signs Bylaw in the District Plan.

The Signs Bylaw contains different prohibited signs to those listed within Section 18 of the District Plan and other inconsistencies such as the maximum height for veranda face signs which varies between the Signs Bylaw and the District Plan.

In summary, the dual control mechanism for controlling signs creates a level of complexity that is not considered necessary or appropriate for a resource management issue such as signs.

2. The Definition of Signs

The definition of sign in the District Plan states:

"Means:

- a) any name, figure, character, outline, display, delineation, announcement, design, logo, mural or other artwork, poster, handbill, banner, captive balloon, flag, flashing sign, flat board, free-standing sign, illuminated sign, moving signs, roof sign, sandwich board, streamer, hoarding or any other thing of a similar nature which is:
 - i) intended to attract attention; and
 - ii) visible from a road or any public place; and
- b) all material and components comprising the sign, its frame, background, structure, any support and any means by which the sign is attached to any other thing".

This definition is incredibly broad and effectively captures almost every form of physical advertising within the District.

Recently, a number of resource consent and compliance issues have arisen regarding when a window display and/or signage located within a building (but visible through a window) constitutes signage that is controlled by the District Plan and/or the Signs Bylaw.

It is noted that the singular Objective for signs in Section 18 of the Operative District Plan refers specifically to "outdoor signs". The Objective states:

"<u>Outdoor signs</u> which convey necessary information, while avoiding or mitigating any adverse effects on public safety, convenience and access or on the visual amenities of the Districts important landscape, townscape, heritage and water area values".[emphasis added].

Additionally, four out of the eight policies¹ supporting this objective refer specifically to <u>outdoor signs</u>. In addition, Part 2 of the Operative District Plan – *Information and Interpretation* at Section 2.14 outlines the information requirements for land use consents and at (n) refers to <u>outdoor advertising</u> as follows:

"Outdoor Advertising

Any outdoor advertising proposed, including the dimensions, height, lettering and location (freestanding or on buildings) of any signage, or any illumination proposed."

It is clear that the intention of the existing District Plan sign provisions is to manage only signs/advertising located on the exterior face of buildings however, the definition of signs does not offer such a clear interpretation.

Clarification needs to be provided as to when Council no longer has control over signage/advertising that is visible through a window to give retailers and commercial building owners some certainty over the use of their shopfront windows.

3. Activity Status for Signs

The signage provisions in Section 18 - Signs of the District Plan are Zone Standards. Accordingly, all signs that require resource consent will have a Non-Complying Activity status.

Signs are an anticipated feature within all Zones (to varying degrees) and therefore requiring such a restrictive activity status is considered inappropriate.

The QLDC Signs Monitoring Report 2012 recorded that between November 2003 and February 2012, 343 resource consent applications for signage had been triggered². A total of 64% of these applications were for signs within the Town Centre Zones³.

Only 15 of the total 343 resource consent applications⁴ or 4.3% were publically notified. Only 2.25% of the applications within the Town Centre Zones were publicly notified.

9

¹ Section 18 – Signs of the Operative Queenstown Lakes District Plan page 18-2 policies 1,3, 5 and 7

² QLDC Signs Monitoring Report 2012 – Section 8, page 20

³ QLDC Signs Monitoring Report 2012 – Section 8, page 21

⁴ QLDC Signs Monitoring Report 2012 – Section 8, page 21

Given that the majority of sign consents applied for are approved on a nonnotified basis, the Non-Complying Activity status is considered overly restrictive. This reporting also identifies that the key area for advantages to be gained in streamlining consent requirements would be in the town centres.

4. Issues with the Size Limits for Signs

The predominant method of triggering resource consent for signs under the existing provisions of Section 18 - Signs of the District Plan is through the specification of maximum size and/or area of signs. Any sign that does not meet the specifications requires Non-Complying Activity consent.

In the Town Centre Zone for example, ground floor signage is restricted to a cumulative 5m² or 15% area of a buildings frontage (whichever is the least).

On large commercial buildings with multiple tenants, Non-Complying Activity consent for signs will normally be triggered even when signage has been specifically and purposefully designed to complement the scale and nature of the building.

The signage provisions are generally written on a 'per building' basis. This approach does not take into consideration that some buildings contain multiple tenancies which each requiring an apportionment of signage for their respective business.

Specifically, the issue with the existing sign provisions for the ground floor of buildings in the Town Centre Zone is that the first tenant in a large building can legitimately establish up to 5m² of signage and then every subsequent tenant in the same building must apply for Non-Complying Activity consent to establish <u>any</u> signage for their business.

Overall, it has been identified that a more simple method of permitting an appropriate level of signage on a per tenancy basis is required as well as providing for a sufficient level of signage on large buildings containing multiple tenants.

5. General Chapter Wide Issues

Submitters on the signs consultation brochure and attendees at the signs workshop in February 2012 have identified that the layout of the existing signs rules in Section 18 of the District Plan is difficult to read and assess.

Specifically, the long lists of Zones to which the signs do and do not apply are not concise and create difficulty in considering the applicable rules. Vivian and Espie have suggested that changing the rules in Section 18 to a table format would help reduce the bulk of this section and make the provisions easier to read.⁵

It has also been established that some of the Section 12 Special Zones such as; Frankton Flats A and Remarkables Park (Activity Area 8) do not have any rules for signage.

⁵ Vivian and Espie Submission on Signs Issues and Options Brochure dated 2 November 2012 Plan Change 48 – Signs – S32

Additionally, the existing rules provide restrictions on the type and size of many different signs but there are no interpretive diagrams in the District Plan to define the various sign types (although there are within the Signs Bylaw). This can lead to inconsistent decision making and debate as to what rules should apply to specific signs.

6. Assessment Matters

Section 18 – Signs of the District Plan currently contains Assessment Matters for signage contained only within the Jacks Point Resort Zone and Mt Cardrona Special Zone.

Vivian and Espie have also identified this matter in their submission on the Signs Issues and Options Brochure. Specific assessment criteria are considered necessary to be added to the District Plan to enable guidance and consistency in the assessment of sign applications.

7. Monitoring

The QLDC Signs Monitoring Report 2012 recognises the difficulty in monitoring with the current provisions where it is stated that:

"It is difficult to determine which signs are consented, either through the bylaw or the District Plan, and which signs are illegal". 6

Compliance officers have acknowledged the difficulties and inefficiencies in accessing sign permit records, resource consent decisions and their subsequent variations to determine the lawfulness (or not) of existing signage.

Any new provisions should be easy and effective to monitor.

EVALUATION

Appropriateness of Objectives to achieve purpose of RMA

Currently the single Objective and its supporting Policies for signs in Section 18 – Signs of the District Plan provide little meaningful guidance to the establishment of new signs other than a broad indication of protecting landscape and visual amenity values and preventing adverse safety effects.

It is proposed to reword the existing Objective and Policies and provide additional Objectives and Policies to provide more meaningful guidance in terms of what the Council seeks to achieve in relation to the establishment of signs within the District.

The existing Objective and Policies for the management of signs within all Zones of the District Plan are set out below:

Section 18 - Signs

"Objective 1 - Outdoor Signs

⁶ QLDC Signs Monitoring Report 2012 Section 7.3 page 16 Plan Change 48 – Signs – S32

Outdoor signs which convey necessary information, while avoiding or mitigating any adverse effects on public safety, convenience and access or on the visual amenities of the District's important landscape, townscape, heritage and water area values.

Policies:

- 1 To ensure the number, size, location and nature of outdoor signs in different areas are in accordance with the character and amenity of those areas and the community's desire to maintain and/or enhance the environment, appearance or visual amenity through attention to:
 - lettering design
 - site specific locations
 - relationship to background surroundings
 - the number, area and height of signs
 - ensuring signs are designed in sympathy with local amenity, visual and heritage values
 - the effect of illumination on adjoining properties and public places.
- 2 To ensure that waterfront signage only provides essential information and directions for people.
- 3 To ensure the display of outdoor signs does not adversely affect traffic safety by causing confusion or distraction to, or obstructing the views, of motorists or pedestrians.
- 4 To ensure all signs are constructed and placed in a manner which does not pose a danger to property or people.
- 5 To ensure outdoor signs in or over public places or attached to utilities, community facilities or public reserves, other than in business areas, are limited to signs necessary for direction, public information or public safety.
- 6 To enable a wide range of sign types within commercial areas consistent with public safety, access needs and the overall character of the area.
- 7 To ensure outdoor signs are limited to those relating to a particular activity, the use of land or buildings, and located on the site of that activity, land or building.
- 8 To support the establishment of information signs, and lay-bys, at the entrance to the District's settlements, and at sites of natural or historical interest.

These provisions are proposed to be re-worded and added to with a series of new Objectives and Policies that provide more meaningful direction to the appropriate establishment of signage. The proposed objectives and policies are set out below:

Objective 1 -Signs

Signs which convey necessary information, while avoiding or mitigating any adverse effects on public safety, convenience and access and on the District's important landscape, streetscape, cultural heritage and water area visual amenity values.

Policies:

- 1 To ensure the number, size, location and design of signs in different areas are compatible with the character and amenity of those areas.
- When located on buildings, to ensure the design and display of signs is consistent with and complementary to the overall design of the building through attention to:
 - · lettering design
 - location on the building
 - relationship to the architectural features of the building and any adjacent buildings
 - · the number, area and height of signs
 - ensuring signs are designed in a way that is compatible with and sympathetic to the amenity, visual, heritage and streetscape values of the surrounding area
 - the effect of illumination on adjoining properties and public places.
- 3 To ensure the design and display of signs does not adversely affect traffic safety by causing confusion or distraction to, or obstructing the views of, motorists or pedestrians.
- 4 To ensure all signs are constructed and located in a manner that does not pose a danger to property and/or obstruction to pedestrians.
- To ensure signs in or over public places or attached to utilities, community facilities or public reserves, other than in business areas, are limited to signs necessary for direction, public information or public safety.
- To enable a diversity of sign types within commercial areas that provide for effective communication of business information and enable commercial individuality whilst maintaining public safety, access needs and the overall character of the area.
- 7 To ensure signs are limited to those relating to a particular activity and/or the use of land or buildings, and are located on the site of that activity, land or building.
- 8 To support the establishment of information signs and lay-bys at the entrance to the District's settlements and at sites of natural, historical or tangata whenua interest.
- 9 To support the use of traditional Kai Tahu (tangata whenua) place names within the District.
- 10 To promote the identification of signage platforms so that signage is considered at the time of building design and to streamline changes in signs associated with changing tenants through the life of a building.

- 11 To provide, in limited circumstances, for offsite signs where it is not practical to display the sign on the site where the activity occurs.
- 12 To provide, in limited circumstances, for signs on commercial buildings of a size or dimension which exceeds that otherwise anticipated in the area where the increased size is visually compatible with the surrounding environment and the scale and character of the building to which it relates
- 13 To manage the extent of signage on windows to promote passive surveillance of streets and encourage visual interest for pedestrians.

Objective 2 - Signs on Waterfronts, Wharves and Jetties

Signs located on waterfronts, wharves and jetties (including signs on buildings on wharves and jetties) that convey necessary information while preserving a high standard of amenity and public views

Policies

- To provide for signs that convey information regarding commercial activities and services that operate from or adjacent to the wharf, jetty or waterfront on which the sign is located.
- 2 To ensure that waterfront signs provide only essential information directly associated with activities based on the surface of lakes and rivers or undertaken within buildings located on wharves and jetties and/or the waterfront
- 3. To ensure that signs on wharves, jetties and waterfronts do not detract from the views and amenity of the foreshore and of the lakes and rivers through inappropriate placement, size and colour.

D144	
RMA	Evaluation
Provision	
Section 5(2)(a)	The Objectives set out above seek to sustain the potential of natural and physical resources (particularly the Districts landscape and visual amenity values) to meet the reasonably foreseeable needs of future generations.
	The objectives recognise the importance of the Districts landscape and visual amenity values and the importance of preserving views and amenity along the Districts waterways.
Section 5(2)(b)	The Objectives do not safeguard the life supporting capacity of air, water, soil and ecosystems. The effects of signage are generally limited to visual effects as opposed to the life supporting elements of natural resources.
Section 5(2)(c)	The Objectives aim to avoid, remedy or mitigate the effects of signage on the environment by directing that signage should be enabled only where it is necessary for the provision of important information, does not

	endanger people (through its materials and location or indirectly by causing distraction) and where the number, size, location and nature of signs is in accordance with the character and amenity of the area in which it is established.
Social wellbeing	The Objectives provide for social well-being by maintaining and/or enhancing the landscape and visual amenity values which are highly regarded by the community through the control of signage that is inappropriate (location, size and content).
	Proposed Objective 2 in particular seeks to avoid signs near waterfronts and reserve areas other than those providing essential information. These policies aim to protect the important publicly accessible recreational areas of the District from visual degradation.
Economic wellbeing	The proposed objectives seek to emphasise the important contribution that signs make to the economic well-being of the business community.
Health and safety	The objectives specifically set up a framework to manage the potential health and safety effects associated with the placement and location of signs.
Cultural wellbeing	The existing Objective and Policies do not explicitly or implicitly provide for cultural wellbeing. Signage can result in a positive effect in this regard. Objective 1, Policies 8 and 9 provide support to the district wide approach of acknowledging tangata whenua.
Section 6	The Objectives specifically protect the special amenity and character of the waterfront areas - a Section 6 matter.
Section 7	The Objectives seek to recognise the potential for signage to affect amenity values.

In summary, it is considered the proposed objectives are the most appropriate way to achieve the purpose of the Act.

Identification of Other Reasonably Practical Options

In determining the most appropriate way to achieve the Objectives identified above the following were considered reasonably practical options.

1.1.1 Option 1: Status quo/ No change

Leaving the provisions for the management of new signs in the District Plan. This would not necessarily address the seven identified issues listed in Section 6 above.

Option 2: Retain and Improve

Retain the majority of the operative Objective, Policies and rules for the management of new signs in the District Plan but amend where appropriate to address the identified issues. This would not resolve the issue of the dual control mechanism (Signs Bylaw and District Plan) that currently exists.

Option 3: Comprehensive Review

Complete a review of the entire approach to the management of new signs in the District with the intention of using the District Plan as the singular statutory control i.e. remove the need for the dual approach with the Signs Bylaw.

	Option 1: Status quo/ No change	Option 2: Retain and Improve	Option 3: Comprehensive Review
Costs	Does not address the identified issues, and risks the ongoing ambiguity with the existing sign provisions in the District Plan and the link to the Signs Bylaw.	Has costs associated with going through the Plan review process.	Would impose a cost associated with going through the Plan change process.
	Applicants will continue to incur costs for resource consents for signage that is generally found to be appropriate and processed on a nonnotified basis.	The Signs Bylaw will still have a role in the management of signage and may also need updating to be consistent with the District Plan.	
Benefits	Low cost for Council.	Retains the established approach to management of signs and improves the current ambiguity between the District Plan provisions and the Signs Bylaw.	Would allow a fresh and comprehensive look at the Signs section of the District Plan enabling a single point of reference for the management of signs within the District. Would enable an updating of the format of the rules and amendments/introduction of rules, Objectives, Policies and assessment matters to provide guidance on the implementation of signs in the District.
Ranking	3	2	1

A key aim in considering a review of this chapter has been to assist in simplification and to provide greater clarity and certainty.

In accordance with these aims and based on the assessment above, Option 3: Comprehensive Review, is considered the most practicable option.

This recognises that the existing Objective and Policies are reasonably effective, but that a number of changes could be made to address the identified issues with the rules and the removal of the complexity of using both the District Plan and a Bylaw to better achieve the purpose of the Act.

It should be noted that a Bylaw would generally need to be revoked to no longer have effect. However, the current signage Bylaw was not reviewed within the timeframes required of the LGA and therefore is deemed to have been revoked. Accordingly, no further process is required to ensure signage is controlled only through the District Plan.

Assessment of Provisions (Policies, Rules and other methods)

It has been established that the Objectives are the most appropriate way of achieving the purpose of the Act. This section will consider whether, having regard to their efficiency and effectiveness, the proposed Policies are the most appropriate way to achieve the Objectives. The Policies may relate to more than one Objective.

The following table provides an assessment and summary of the reasons for deciding on the Policies.

- (a) The assessment of the efficiency and effectiveness of provisions is based on the assessment of costs and benefits, risk and any other relevant matter identified.
- The assessment of relevant benefits and costs is undertaken in terms of environmental, economic, social and cultural matters. This will include opportunities for economic growth that are anticipated to be provided or reduced and employment anticipated to be provided or reduced where relevant. If practical the benefits and costs will be quantified
- The assessment of the risk of acting or not acting will only be undertaken if there is uncertain or insufficient information about the subject matter or provisions

From the 'Signs' chapter '

Objective 1 - Signs

Signs which convey necessary information, while avoiding or mitigating any adverse effects on public safety, convenience and access and on the District's important landscape, streetscape, cultural heritage and water area visual amenity values.

Policies for Achieving Objective 1

- 1 To ensure the number, size, location and design of signs in different areas are compatible with the character and amenity of those areas.
- When located on buildings, to ensure the design and display of signs is consistent with and complementary to the overall design of the building through attention to:

- · lettering design
- location on the building
- relationship to the architectural features of the building and any adjacent buildings
- the number, area and height of signs
- ensuring signs are designed in a way that is compatible with and sympathetic to the amenity, visual, heritage and streetscape values of the surrounding area
- the effect of illumination on adjoining properties and public places.
- 3 To ensure the design and display of signs does not adversely affect traffic safety by causing confusion or distraction to, or obstructing the views of, motorists or pedestrians.
- 4 To ensure all signs are constructed and located in a manner that does not pose a danger to property and/or obstruction to pedestrians .pedestrians.
- To ensure signs in or over public places or attached to utilities, community facilities or public reserves, other than in business areas, are limited to signs necessary for direction, public information or public safety.
- To enable a diversity of sign types within commercial areas that provide for effective communication of business information and enable commercial individuality whilst maintaining public safety, access needs and the overall character of the area.
- 7 To ensure signs are limited to those relating to a particular activity and/or the use of land or buildings, and are located on the site of that activity, land or building.

- 8 To support the establishment of information signs and lay-bys at the entrance to the District's settlements and at sites of natural, or historical or tangata whenua interest.
- 9 To support the use of traditional Kai Tahu (tangata whenua) place names within the District.
- 10 To promote the identification of signage platforms so that signage is considered at the time of building design and to streamline changes in signs associated with changing tenants through the life of a building.
- 11 To provide, in limited circumstances, for offsite signs where it is not practical to display the sign on the site where the activity occurs.
- 12 To provide, in limited circumstances, for signs on commercial buildings of a size or dimension which exceeds that otherwise anticipated in the area where the increased size is visually compatible with the surrounding environment and the scale and character of the building to which it relates

To manage the extent of signage on windows to promote passive surveillance of streets and encourage visual interest for pedestrians.

Efficiency and Effectiveness (a)	Benefits (b)	Costs (b)	Risk acting/ not acting (c)
The proposed Policies outlined	The environmental benefits of the	The proposed Policies supporting	There is no uncertainty regarding the
above achieve the Objective by	proposed policies include the	this Objective may have an economic	.proposed Policies.
cumulatively addressing the key	maintenance and/or enhancement of	cost to the business community.	
potential effects of signage which	the environment, appearance and		
occur in the District which are listed	visual amenity of the District.	Specifically, proposed Policy 4 will	
in the objective being safety,		discourage the use of signs that	
convenience and access, and visual	Of particular importance is reference	obstruct pedestrian access. In the	
amenities.	in Policy 13 to retaining visual	Town Centres, flat boards / sandwich	
	permeability between buildings and	boards have historically been an	
Specifically, Policies 2, 3 and 6	the streetscape. This Policy is	impediment to pedestrian access	
address the need to ensure public	directly intended to support the	(even though they are not permitted	

safety.

Policy 4 directly addresses the need to avoid obstructions (flat boards etc.) for convenience of access for pedestrians.

Policies 1 5, 6, 7 and 13 promote the maintenance of visual amenity either directly through reference to content/materials or indirectly through requiring only signage that is necessary for the provision of important information. These policies also recognise the important role signage plays for businesses and therefore economic activity.

Policies 8 and 9 promote the ongoing recognition of the importance of tangata whenua values in the District.

Policy 10 provides for an avoidance of duplication of consents, consequential to changing needs.

Policies 11 and 12 provide for nonstandard circumstances.

Overall the Policies are considered to effectively and efficiently achieve the proposed Objective.

proposed rule of no more than 50% coverage of glazing to avoid substantially changing the function of windows in the Town Centres and thus the visual amenity of the streetscape as detailed in the Objective.

The economic benefits are that the proposed Polices (particularly Policy 5, 10, 11, 12 and 13) support the establishment of a diverse range of signage within commercial areas of the District. This recognises the importance of advertising to a business's economic well-being. Providing for identification of signage platforms will improve cost efficiencies for business in updating or changing signs.

Encouraging the use of cultural recognition is deemed to be beneficial to the overall interpretation and enjoyment of the District.

outside the boundary of the site to which they relate) and this Policy may result in a greater impediment to approving these types of sign in the future. This may reduce cost effective sign options for some businesses. From the 'Signs' chapter '

Objective 2 - Signs on Waterfronts, Wharves and Jetties

Signs located on waterfronts, wharves and Jetties (including buildings on wharves and jetties) that convey necessary information while preserving a high standard of amenity and public views.

Policies for Achieving Objective 2

- 1 To provide for signs that convey information regarding commercial surface of the water activities that berth from or adjacent to the wharf, jetty or water front on which the sign is located.
- 2 To ensure that waterfront signage provides only essential information directly associated with activities based on the surface of the water or undertaken within buildings that are established on wharves and jetties.
- To ensure that signage on the Districts wharves, jetties and water fronts does not detract from the views and amenity of the foreshore and the lakes and rivers through inappropriate placement, size and colour of signage.

Efficiency and Effectiveness (a)	Benefits (b)	Costs (b)	Risk acting/ not acting (c)
The proposed Policies outlined	The proposed Policies are	The proposed Policies are	There is no uncertainty regarding the
above achieve the Objective by	considered to have positive	considered to have no social and	proposed Policies.
providing clear direction that signage	environmental effects by placing	cultural costs.	
on jetties and wharves must be	significant emphasis on protection of		
associated with activities undertaken	views and amenity of the foreshore	The environmental costs are that	
on or in directly adjacent proximity to	and surface of the water –	there will be an opportunity for some	
the wharf and jetty concerned.	particularly proposed Policy 3.	commercial signage to be	
		established along the Districts	
This ensures that large event signs	Further, the proposed Policies also	wharves, jetties and waterfronts.	
or signs advertising activities and	seek to limit signage to only that	However, with full Discretion	
businesses that are not associated	necessary and directly associated	proposed for any such signage the	
with the wharf or jetty in question will	with surface of the water activities	environmental costs are considered	
not be able to be established on	that berth at the wharf/jetty/waterfront	to be less than is the case with the	
wharves and jetties.	in question or activities established	existing District Plan provisions which	

Further, the proposed Policies (in association with the proposed Rules) will close an anomaly in the District Plan that would allow any signs on Wharves and Jetties to be established as a Permitted Activity (no provisions currently exist for signage in the Queenstown Town Centre Waterfront Zone.

By restricting the number or type of advertisers (Policy 1) who can advertise on wharves and jetties and associated buildings as well as providing direction on the protection of visual amenity values (Policy 3) it is considered that the Policies will achieve the purpose of the proposed Objective which primarily is to preserve a high standard of amenity and public views along the Districts waterways.

within buildings on the Wharf or jetty in question.

Accordingly, these proposed Policies (particularly Policies 2 and 3) will aid in preventing a proliferation of signage on the Districts important water fronts and reduce the visual impact of signs in these areas.

In terms of economic effects the proposed Policies are expected to provide direction as to what waterfront signage will be considered appropriate therefore applicants have direction as to whether their signage proposal will be acceptable prior to spending money on an uncertain (Discretionary) resource consent process.

The proposed Policies are not considered to have any social or cultural benefits.

as described above contain an anomaly that provide for signage on wharves and jetties to be Permitted Activities.

With the proposed Policies/Objectives and Rules the Council will have the opportunity to assess signage and consider its appropriateness through guidance in the District Plan. This is not necessarily the case with the existing provisions.

In terms of economic costs, the proposed policies are intended to prevent 'significant' amounts of signage on or near the Districts water fronts therefore, there may be commercial operators who find these policies restrictive and an impediment to the successful advertising of their business and overall economic well-being.

Rules and Methods

It has been established above that the proposed polices are the most appropriate way of achieving the objectives. This section will consider whether, having regard to their efficiency and effectiveness, the proposed amendments to rules and other methods are the most appropriate for achieving the Objectives. The rules may relate to a number of Objectives.

The following tables provide an assessment and summary of the reasons for deciding on the provisions.

Definitions and Interpretative Diagrams

As part of the Review of Section 18 – Signs of the District Plan it is proposed to amend the definition of "Signs". In addition, it is proposed to add interpretive diagrams into Appendix 4 of the District Plan to describe and detail the various sign types.

Efficiency and Effectiveness (a)	Benefits ^(b)	Costs (b)	Risk acting/ not acting (c)
The proposed amendment to the definition of sign will remove the current ambiguity and inconsistent	The amended definition will reduce compliance and enforcement monitoring issues by specifying that	The proposed definition introduces a small risk that some business owners in the commercial areas and	It is considered that there is no uncertainty in making the suggested amendments/additions.
assessment of signs/advertising established <u>within</u> the internal structure of a building.	only external signage on a building is considered under the signs provisions.	particularly the Town Centre Zones will 'blanket out' their entire <u>internal</u> window frontages.	
Specifically, the definition will align with the existing Objective and Policies by assessing only external/outdoor signs. Accordingly, the proposed definition will be effective in achieving the proposed Objectives.	This will also simplify and/or reduce the need for resource consent for some advertising which will be of economic benefit to commercial businesses and will avoid unnecessary consent applications for Council planning staff to consider.	This risk is considered to be low and acceptable given the significant reduction in ambiguity the new definition will provide (in regards to whether internal advertising is controlled by the District Plan).	
The addition of interpretative diagrams will assist in providing a consistent understanding and assessment of signs and will	Both the new definition and the interpretative diagrams will increase consistency in the assessment of signage throughout the District.	In addition, signage of this nature that blankets out a sufficient area of internal glazing (i.e. greater than 50%) in the commercial areas would be deemed a change to the external	

Plan Change 48 – Signs – S32 24

therefore be effective in achieving the	appearance of a building because
proposed Objectives.	the glazing would no longer perform
	its designed function of being a
	permeable surface and allowing for
	interaction between the inside of a
	shop and the streetscape. This can
	be enforced as a change of external
	appearance pursuant to the
	provisions of Section 10 – Town
	Centres and Section 12 – Business
	and Industrial Zones of the District
	Plan and resource consent required if
	necessary. Resource consent
	RM100816 Night and Day Foodstuffs
	Limited sets a precedent signage
	deemed a change to the external
	appearance of glazing.

Commercial Zone Rules

As part of the Review of Section 18 – Signs of the District Plan it is proposed to amend the format of the signs rules such that there are four Tables outlining the rules for signs in the Commercial, Residential, and Other Zones as well as general District Wide sign provisions. Proposed Activity Table 1 contains the rules for the Districts Key Commercial Zones.

Efficiency and Effectiveness (a)	Benefits (b)	Costs (b)	Risk acting/ not acting (c)
The proposed rules in Table 1 –	The proposed rules for Permitted	The proposed rules will result in a	It is considered that there is no un-
Commercial Zones are considered	Activities will reduce the time, cost	small cost in that the Council will no	certainty in making the suggested
effective at achieving the Objectives.	and uncertainty to commercial	longer have control over the design	amendments/additions.
	businesses that currently and	of every sign established within the	
The proposed rules recognise the	unnecessarily overshadows the	District.	
commercial/economic importance of	approval process for signs in the		
signs by allowing for a number of	District.	This loss of 'control' is expected to	
important information signs (arcade		have a negligible cost because the	
directory, upstairs entrance signs	It will reduce the number of small and	Permitted signage will be in key	

etc.) and signs within previously assessed and approved sign platforms to be established as Permitted Activities in the key commercial Zones where signage should be reasonably anticipated.

The proposed rules allow for other signs to be considered as a Controlled Activity provided they do not exceed 15% of a buildings frontage or an individual tenancies proportional frontage.

This recognises the importance of signage for commercial businesses and provides certainty of approval for a level of signage considered appropriate within the key Commercial Zones of the District. The requirement for Discretionary Activity consent for any signs that breach the Permitted or Controlled Rules is considered to afford appropriate protection to the landscape and visual amenity values that are important to the District.

These rules achieve the Objectives 1 and 2 by providing a more 'permissive' approach to signage within the key commercial areas of the District whilst remaining cognisant of the protection of visual amenity and streetscape values.

inconsequential signage consents processed by Council.

The Controlled activity provisions provide for a greater level of signage than is currently provided for under the District Plan but enables each tenant to provide signage for their own tenancy by removing the current 'first in first served' approach to all allocated signage on a building.

The proposed Controlled activity status will continue to allow Council input into the management of sign content/materials/colours to protect landscape/visual amenity.

The proposed Discretionary Activity status for signs in contravention of the Permitted and Controlled Activity rules allows for additional signage to be considered on its merits but still provides the Council with sufficient discretion to decline inappropriate signage to protect character, visual amenity and streetscape values.

commercial areas where signage (and its associated effects) are anticipated.

Further, while the design and content of some signs will no longer be directly able to be controlled by Council the location and size of signage platforms will still be assessed by the Council.

The costs of altering the signage provisions through a formal plan change have already been considered and budgeted for as part of the overall District Plan Review process.

Residential Zone Rules

As part of the Review of Section 18 – Signs of the District Plan it is proposed to amend the format of the signs rules such that there are four Tables outlining the rules for signs in the key Commercial, Residential, and Other Zones as well as general District Wide sign provisions. Proposed Activity Table 2 contains the rules for the Districts Residential Zones.

Efficiency and Effectiveness (a)	Benefits ^(b)	Costs (b)	Risk acting/ not acting (c)
The proposed rules in Table 2 –	The proposed rules enable small	The proposed Permitted Activity	It is considered that there is no un-
Residential Zones are considered	amounts of commercial signage to be	status has some potential cost	certainty in making the suggested
effective at meeting the Objectives.	established in the residential areas	associated with not requiring	amendments/additions.
	as a Permitted Activity.	approval for the content or location of	
The proposed rules recognise the		signs if they meet the permitted	
commercial/economic importance of	This provides certainty for	standards.	
signs by allowing for the	commercial operators in these areas		
establishment of limited signage as a	that signs can be established as of	This cost is considered to managed	
Permitted Activity.	right.	to an acceptable level through the	
This was idea as were will be also as	Mith Council as to initiate Control according	size restrictions that is proposed	
This provides commercial businesses	With Council retaining Control over	(0.5m2)	
in the Residential Zones certainty	the signage being established that		
that they will be able to have a small	exceeds the permitted limits the		
amount of signage appropriate to the residential setting.	environmental effects of signs such as the character and amenity effects		
residential setting.	on residential areas and the		
Any signs that exceed the	community's desire to maintain		
requirements for Permitted Activities	and/or enhance the environment,		
can still be considered on their merits	appearance or visual amenity		
as a Discretionary Activity.	dominance on the streetscape etc.		
as a Discretionary Activity.	can be effectively avoided, remedied		
This activity status enables Council	or mitigated whilst still streamlining		
the Discretion to grant consent if the	the consent process.		
environmental effects are appropriate			
for the character and amenity of the	Such rules are effective in meeting		
area.	the Objectives and particularly		
	Objective 1.		

Plan Change 48 – Signs – S32 27

Rural Zone Rules	Rural Zone Rules					
As part of the Review of Section 18 – Signs of the District Plan it is proposed to amend the format of the signs rules such that there are four Tables outlining the rules for signs in the key Commercial, Residential, and Other Zones as well as general District Wide sign provisions. Proposed Activity Table 3 contains the rules for the Districts Other Zones.						
Efficiency and Effectiveness (a)	Benefits (b)	Costs (b)	Risk acting/ not acting (c)			
The proposed rules in Table 3 – Rural Zones are considered effective at meeting the Objectives. The proposed rules recognise the	The proposed rules enable small amounts of commercial signage to be established in the rural areas of the District as a Permitted Activity.	This cost of requiring consent for signs exceeding the permitted limits is considered to be outweighed by the reduced ambiguity of having to	It is considered that there is no uncertainty in making the suggested amendments/additions.			
commercial/economic importance of signs by allowing for the establishment of limited signage as a Permitted Activity.	This provides certainty for commercial operators in these areas that signs can be established without resource consent being required. With Council retaining Control over	comply with the Bylaw and/or District Plan provisions. Likewise, it will ease the complexity of monitoring and enforcement with only the District Plan provisions and not the Bylaw to				
This provides commercial businesses in the Rural Zones certainty that they will be able to have a small amount of signage appropriate to the Rural environment.	signage that exceeds the permitted limits through requiring Discretionary Activity consent the environmental effects of signs such as visual amenity, character; dominance on the street scape etc. can be	contend with.				
Some level of control is considered necessary for signs that exceed the permitted limits to manage potential adverse effects.	effectively avoided, remedied or mitigated whilst still streamlining the consent process.					
This visual amenity requires an adequate level of protection and the Discretionary Activity status for any	Accordingly, the proposed rules compliment the proposed Objectives 1 and 2.					

Plan Change 48 – Signs – S32

signs that do not meet the Permitted		
Activity requirements affords the		
Council Discretion to grant consent		
only if the environmental effects are		
appropriate for the character and		
amenity of the area.		

District Wide Rules

As part of the Review of Section 18 – Signs of the District Plan it is proposed to amend the format of the signs rules such that there are four Tables outlining the rules for signs in the key Commercial, Residential, and Other Zones as well as general District Wide sign provisions. Proposed Activity Table 4 contains the rules for the District Wide Signs Rules.

Efficiency and Effectiveness (a)	Benefits (b)	Costs (b)	Risk acting/ not acting (c)
The proposed rules in Table 4 –	The proposed rules provided in a	The majority of the proposed rules	It is considered that there is no un-
District Wide Rules are considered	table format provide for a quick and	contained within this table exist either	certainty in making the suggested
effective at meeting the Objectives.	easy reference point in the District	through the District Plan or the Signs	amendments/additions.
	Plan for the provisions applying to all	Bylaw or a combination of both.	
The proposed rules recognise the	Zones. This simplifies the existing		
commercial/economic importance of	District Plan provisions.	Accordingly, the costs of	
various 'non typical signs' such as		implementing the proposed rules will	
real estate signs, temporary event	The proposed Rules generally	be negligible for those parties	
signs and signs on wharves and	incorporate the rules found within the	affected by these rules.	
jetties which compliments Objectives	existing District Plan provisions and		
1 and 2.	the Signs Bylaw with few changes as	New provisions are included to cover	
	consultation did not raise any issues	signs on Wharves and Jetties. These	
In addition, the Rules provide	with these provisions.	may impact on the number and type	
appropriate structure and guidance		of signs that are able to be	
on sign sizes and numbers,	Accordingly, the key benefits are the	established on such structures and	
appropriate content and methods of	simplicity of the new format for users	will require resource consent to be	
display/attraction which is considered	of the District Plan and the familiarity	applied for at the applicants cost.	
to protect visual amenity and	and general acceptance of these		
character of the areas in which they	existing provisions.	The cost of the Plan Change process	
are established therefore achieving		to adopt these changes has been	

Plan Change 48 – Signs – S32

the Objectives 1 and 2.	Also the District Wide Provisions will	budgeted for as part of the overall	
	assist in maintaining the character	District Plan Review process.	
	and visual amenity of the various		
	District Plan Zones and the views		
	and outlook of the Districts important		
	landscape values.		

7. DESCRIPTIVE TEXT FORMERLY IN THE DISTRICT PLAN

Removed through the Plan Change:

7.1 ISSUES

The purpose of signs is to provide information to members of the public. Primarily this is for the purpose of commercial advertising but also includes important directional signage and notification of special events.

Accordingly, signs are required for a variety of businesses in a range of District Plan Zones. The key issue is maintaining the diverse expectations for visual amenity within these different Zones.

In order to provide for the diverse levels of visual sensitivity, economic well-being and safety, a range of different rules and standards must be incorporated into the District Plan.

7.2 Monitoring

No specific monitoring other than the monitoring required by Section 35 of the RMA is proposed for the Sign provisions. Consent monitoring will continue to be undertaken on a case by case basis.

7.3 Environmental Results Anticipated

- (i) Adequate signage to convey the information necessary for the social, economic and cultural well-being of the community.
- (ii) Minimal adverse effects of signs on traffic and pedestrian safety and access.
- (iii) Maintenance and enhancement of the Districts visual amenity.
- (iv) Colourful, vibrant and effective signage within the commercial areas of the District while still having significant regard to the visual amenity of these areas and pedestrian safety and ease of access.

7.4 Explanation and Principal Reasons for Adoption

The control of outdoor signs generally varies according to the scrutiny of the environment within which they are located. Within the District a number of areas have been identified as being of special significance in terms of their heritage or visual importance. The District contains both rural and urban visual characteristics which are integral to the well-being of not just the District, but also the region and the country.

Because of the overriding objective of protecting and enhancing the visual character of the area, signs, whether it is in terms of their individual or cumulative effective, require control in terms of their number, size, and scale.

Those aspects of signs, which cause the greatest concerns, often relate to their design and placement. The District Plan rules provide appropriate regulations on these matters and seek to minimise any detraction from the appearance of buildings neighbourhoods, town centres, landscape or water features.

7.5 Implementation Methods

The Objectives and associated Policies will be implemented through a number of methods including:

- (i) District Plan
 - (a) Through rules in the District Plan; and
 - (b) Through the implementation of conditions on resource consents to control the location, number and size and type of outdoor signs.

(ii) Other Methods

- (a) The exercise of control as owner and designating authority for all roads in the District, other than State Highways.
- (b) Encouragement to New Zealand Transport Authority for the implementation of New Zealand Transport Agency (Signs on State Highways Bylaw) 2010 in regards to advertising signs on State Highways.
- (c) Through the Annual Plan, as resources are available, to support the establishment of information signs for the Districts settlements and for sites of historical and natural interests.